



PROGRAMME REVIEW



**SCOUTING
IRELAND**

ONE PROGRAMME REVIEW HIGH LEVEL FINDINGS

Authors:

James Carroll
Dubheasa Kelly

March 8th 2017



Copyright © Scouting Ireland 2017

Scouting Ireland,
National Office,
Larch Hill,
Dublin 16.

Tel: 00 353 1 495 6300

E-mail: research@scouts.ie

Web: www.scouts.ie

Published by Scouting Ireland.

The integrity of this document should be maintained – all data, text and images within this document should be interpreted within the context of this document as a whole. This report may be reproduced in whole or in part, except for commercial purposes, provided that the source and date thereof are stated.

Copies of this report are available on the Scouting Ireland website: www.scouts.ie



Contents

Section	Page
Contents.....	2
1 Introduction	3
1.1 Welcome	3
1.2 Background.....	4
1.3 Fundamentals of Youth Programme	5
2 Review Process	8
2.1 Review Approach	8
2.2 Review Design	9
2.3 Data Collection	10
2.4 Data Analysis Methodology	11
2.5 Participant Numbers	12
3 Summary Findings.....	13
3.1 Successes.....	13
3.2 Challenges	19
3.3 Beavers Scouts	27
3.4 Cub Scouts	29
3.5 Scouts	31
3.6 Venture Scouts	33
3.7 Rover Scouts.....	35
3.8 Chief Scout Award	37
3.9 Large Scale Considerations.....	39
4 Barriers to Youth Programme.....	41
5 Outside the Scope.....	44
6 Conclusion.....	45



1 Introduction

1.1 Welcome

Fellow Scouters and Scouts,

Every week, up and down the country Scouters spend countless hours facilitating Youth Programme in their communities. We do it because we made a promise, we do it because we love it and we do it because we are passionate about the transformation Scouting can, and does make in the lives of our members.

Programme and the Scout Method are not just words or concepts they are the living embodiment of how we put fun and adventure into our lives and the lives of those around us. Baden Powell often spoke of the Game of Scouting as opposed to the delivery of Scouting. This is how we differentiate between the doing - the Game and the management of our association, the Business of Scouting. Every so often there comes a time where these two elements must meet.

A review of our Programme materials is such a point. It is a time when we need to look at our materials, our ways and our methods to see if they are fit for purpose. This was no small challenge but it is one we were very eager to complete.

My team and I work tirelessly to try and support Scouting on the ground Scouting. Tools, like the outputs of this review, will aid in helping us understand how we better accomplish that goal. Ultimately, we all want to work together for the betterment of our members.

In the following pages, you will find a wealth of data related to how we deliver Programme. I thank all of you who engaged in the review and I hope those of you who read on will find it informative and enlightening.

Yours in Scouting,

David Shalloo

Chief Commissioner (Youth Programme)



1.2 Background

When Scouting Ireland came into existence it inherited a number of different programmes and structures from its legacy associations. A large scale Programme Review and Development for Scouting Ireland concluded in 2010 with the launch of ONE Programme. ONE Programme is the method, we in Scouting Ireland use, to deliver scouting to our members. It is designed as a tool to aid the Scout Method and the delivery of its thirty-six learning objectives. Each section (Beaver Scouts, Cub Scouts, Scouts, Venture Scouts, Rover Scouts) has a number of age-appropriate tools, resources and frameworks with additional elements that are non-section specific.

One of the core principles at the heart of ONE Programme Methodology is the concept of Plan-Do-Review. This is a concept whereby our goals, activities and progress should be reflected upon through self-assessment/reflection and or peer review as we progress. With this in mind it was envisaged that ONE Programme would undergo the Review component after five years of active use.

In 2009 National Council mandated that this review should take place by 2014; National Council 2014, 2015 and 2016 reaffirmed this. In addition, a second National Council motion in 2016 requested a thorough review of a ONE Programme component, the Chief Scout Award, which forms part of this report. This document is the findings component of this review.

The aim of the review is to establish the effectiveness of ONE Programme in supporting the delivery of scouting to the youth members of Scouting Ireland.

Objectives:

1. To evaluate the effectiveness of Scouting Ireland's current youth programme in supporting the delivery of scouting to youth members.
2. To evaluate the effectiveness of the tools and resources currently available - if used, how they are used and when, and if not, why not?



3. To establish the current barriers and pathways to delivering youth programme.

1.3 Fundamentals of Youth Programme

The purpose of ONE Programme is to deliver youth programme across all our age ranges with a similar structure, in a coherent manner. Through this certain elements and concepts are present in each section but each is tailored in an age-appropriate fashion. Resources and materials are designed to appeal to the age range of the specific section while presenting the same concepts in each section via age-appropriate visual aids, language and personal journeys.

Some of the building blocks of ONE Programme are:

1. The use of The Scout Method
2. Placing Youth Participation at the heart of the planning process
3. Individual personal journeys / experiences
4. Age-appropriate Programme Materials to support young people.

1.3.1 The Scout Method

The Scout Method is Scouting's unique method of delivering Scouting to young people. The Scout Method is comprised of eight components which are equally important and when collectively implemented make scouting what it is. It is through the use of the Scout Method that Scouting Ireland achieves its aims in developing young people.

Promise & Law	The commitment to a code of living based on the values of the Scout movement.
Personal Progression	A scheme to support the development of knowledge, skills and attitudes in all areas and to provide recognition for individual and group achievements.
Learning by Doing	An approach that prioritises learning through practice, first-hand experience, and from both successes and mistakes;
Small Group System	Progressive, democratic and self- governing groups, usually of 6-8



	young people, are the basic organisational structure of Scouting;
Nature and the Outdoors	The natural environment is the primary setting for Scouting offering unique opportunities for the development of the young person;
Symbolic Framework	Provides a setting for Scouting that stimulates the imagination through symbols, themes and stories;
Young People & Adults working together	A partnership model in which young people are supported to become increasingly self-governing and independent
Service and Commitment	Recognises the importance of contributing to society by caring for others and the world around us.

1.3.2 Youth Participation in Planning

Young people, of all ages, are involved in the planning of their programme. They lead the creation of their Scouting experience. This is done via small groups, section specific council gatherings and by goal planning and attainment. Putting the programme in the hands of the young people is a core tenant of the Scouting Ireland Youth Programme.

Our Youth Programme is planned, activities are executed and the whole process is reviewed. This review process is an important stage as it enables young people to learn by doing, reflect on what has been learnt and to carry this knowledge forward. The youth programme that young people have designed, with the help and assistance of Scouters, follows a simple process; PLAN, DO, REVIEW.

1.3.3 Individual Personal Journeys

Every Scout is responsible for their personal journey and their experience of Scouting. The personal journey challenges a young person to set goals to achieve, enables learning, permits the acquisition of knowledge, while participating in the Scouting Irelands Youth programme. The review and reflection process is an important part of the personal journey. It allows them to learn, adapt and improve, which can be conducted in group reviews, peer reviews and or personal reviews dependent on the situation.



1.3.4 Age-appropriate Programme Materials

The award schemes have continuity across the sections. There are four types of award schemes available to young people in each section resulting in the recognition of achievement or competencies.

These are:

- Personal Progression Badges
- Adventure Skills Badges
- Special Interest Badges
- Nautical Badges

The books, materials, programme aids and symbolic frameworks are individual to each section and were designed to be age-appropriate. In addition to this, each section has its own Chief Scout Award.



2 Review Process

The task of reviewing a programme used by 40,143 youth members in 510 Groups, which has hundreds of individual components, was no small task. To achieve this, a strict methodology was required. It was acknowledged that engaging the membership in this process was paramount, specifically to understand their experience and opinion on programme.

2.1 Review Approach

The aim of the review was to develop an understanding of how effective ONE Programme tools and materials were performing in supporting the core fundamentals of our programme. The scope of the evaluation is limited to the effectiveness of ONE Programme supporting the delivery of Scouting. The process began by specifically focusing on the following areas:

- Is the programme effective in supporting the delivery of scouting?
- Is the programme operating as planned? What actually happens during the programme?
- Is the programme working, and if not, why not?
- How can the programme be improved?
- What are the barriers to ONE Programme?

These questions were central to establishing the scope of the review project. These questions were explored and refined leading to the identification of the scope of the evaluation, its aim and core research questions. These areas were identified as the research questions to be answered via the evaluation process and were instrumental in shaping the data collection stage.

The aim of the evaluation is to establish the effectiveness of ONE Programme in supporting the delivery of scouting to the youth members of Scouting Ireland.

The evaluation specific objectives are as follows:

- To evaluate the effectiveness of Scouting Irelands current programme in supporting the delivery of scouting to youth members.
- To evaluate the effectiveness of the tools and resources currently available - if used, how they are used and when, and if not, why not?
- To establish the current barriers and pathways to the programme.



Following from identifying the scope of the project it was necessary to identify what is deemed outside of scope of this process. This was performed to ensure that the evaluation process was clear of the focus and that the aim of the evaluation process was not strayed from. It was decided that this evaluation would not permit the establishment of the impact of ONE Programme on youth members. Nor would it evaluate the impact of scouting on youth members. An examination of the fundamentals of Scouting Irelands programme such as the Scout Method, Educational Trails, Scouting Ireland’s Aim and Objectives was not within the scope of this evaluation. An evaluation of whether the aim of Scouting Ireland is being met was not possible either within this project, and finally, how scouting and Scouting Ireland meets the needs of Irish youth and society was not included within this process.

2.2 Review Design

An evaluation research process was chosen as it has a distinctive purpose rather than traditional research, which explores new or different topics. The purpose of an evaluation is not to prove a theory as traditional research does but to improve the subject of the evaluation.

This evaluation had a two-pronged approach:

Formative Evaluation	Is conducted with the intention to improve ONE Programme.
Process Evaluation	An exploration of what is actually taking place in sections across Scouting Ireland. While in parallel, gaining an understanding from the developers and implementers of the intended working of the programme, thus enabling a mapping of theory to practice leading to the identification of gaps.



2.3 Data Collection

A three stage progression was designed to meet the requirements of the process and ensure the inclusion of all stakeholders and participant types.

Stage 1 - Surveys

Method: Online Questionnaire for Scouters and Young People (Adults and Adolescents)
Worksheets for Beaver and Cub Scouts (Children)

Purpose and Comments:

- Data collection is to enable the understanding of how ONE Programme is operating across all sections and member types.
- To explore the frequency, application and satisfaction of all elements.
- Engage as many members (Practitioners) as possible; the process was open for ALL to engage.

Stage 2 Workshops

Method: Participative Workshop with Action Research and Focus Action Research Groups for Scouters and Young People (Adults and Adolescents)

Purpose and Comments:

Data collection is to understand the practice of ONE Programme. Specifically;

- To understand how programme works or does not work on the ground
- Identify how people are scouting
- Identify the barriers to ONE Programme
- Engage with the membership locally across all six provinces

Stage 3 - Focus Group

Method: Participative Workshop with Action Research and Focus Action Research Groups for developers and implementers (Adults and Adolescents)

Purpose and Comments:

Data collection is to enable an understanding how ONE Programme was designed to operate.

- Desire to capture institutional memory

This three stage process permits triangulation across results, enabling the identification of valid and reliable findings, thus resulting in a stronger research design. The purpose of triangulation is to capture different dimensions of the same phenomenon using various samples and methods of data collection to ensure the validity of the evaluation process.



2.4 Data Analysis Methodology

This analysis employed a multiple method research methodology involving both quantitative and qualitative analysis. This research uses a cross-sectional design employing a multiple method research methodology involving both quantitative and qualitative data and analysis.

Quantitative

Microsoft Excel was used to perform basic quantitative analysis of the closed-ended survey questions. Pivot tables and excel formula were used where needed to provide frequency and average statistical results. The quantitative methodology was fundamental to understanding the demographic profile of the respondents and the response rates to the questions.

Qualitative

NVivo 10 and Excel were used for the qualitative data analysis of open-ended questions. This software allows qualitative content (such as open-ended questions) to be inputted and thematically analysed. Its functionality was used to code sections of text from the open-ended survey questions with open codes and categories. These were then refined using a reflexive qualitative approach.

Data Organization

The data from each of the five surveys was organised into separate Beaver Scout, Cub Scout, Scout, Venture Scout and Rover Scout Excel files. In addition, the data from each of the Beaver and Cub Scout Poster Survey was inputted into separate Excel file. Quantitative analysis was done using Excel formulae with the results being outputted within the Excel files.



2.5 Participant Numbers

Table 1: Stage 1 Survey Participants Breakdown

Stage 1 Survey	Scout Responses	Scouter Responses	Total Responses
Beaver Scouts (Lodges)	101	246	347
Cub Scouts (Sixes)	141	237	378
Scouts (Patrols & Scouts)	90	322	412
Venture Scouts	147	92	239
Rover Scouts	33	41	74
Total	512	938	1450

Table 2: Stage 2 Participant Breakdown

Stage 2	Scout Participant	Scouter Participant	Total Participants
Dublin Province	10	54	64
South East Province	0	19	19
South Province	4	14	18
West Province	57	23	80
North Province	1	4	5
North East Province	6	31	37
Youth Forum	92	0	92
Scouter Conference	0	37	37
Total	170	182	352

Table 3: Stage 3 Participant Breakdown

Stage 3	Scout Participant	Scouter Participant	Total Participants
	N/A	39	39
Total	N/A	39	39

Table 4: Total Participant Breakdown

Total	Scout Participant	Scouter Participant	Total Participants
Stage 1	512	938	1450
Stage 2	220	145	365
Stage 3	N/A	39	39
Total	682	1122	1804 ¹

¹ Within Stage 1 all Beaver and Cub Scout responses are not individual responses. They are Beaver Lodges and Sixes also within the Scout online survey individual Scout and Patrol responses were received. If we assume there is an average of 6 members per Lodges (n=101) and Sixes (n=141) and an average of 8 members per Scout Patrol (n=20) - resulting in 1,450 (242 x 6 = 1,450) Beaver and Cub Scouts and 160 (8 x 20) Scouts this bring the total participant numbers to 3,412 (7% of membership (Approximate Total Membership 49,000)).



where it is now understood that these elements are central to who Scouting Ireland is. It could be assumed that the introduction of ONE Programme has led this transformation.

3.1.1 Adventure Skills

Adventure Skills have, by any measure, been a run-a-way success. They are widely adopted across all sections. The membership has identified the following as what they like about them:

- They are Clear
- They are Prescriptive
- They offer positive encouragement for driving skills improvement
- They offer something for everyone
- They have an All Section Appeal

The wide scale adoption of this skills competency framework offers the most concrete example of ONE Programme desire to offer some components in a cross section manner.

3.1.2 Youth Development

The support the programme provides in positively developing young people was a reoccurring theme identified during analysis. Interestingly, this was a sub-theme which can be taken in parallel with themes Personal Progression and Empowerment.

Critically, the items that were identified as comprising this theme are, as follows:

- The Programme is a positive learning experience for youth members
- The Programme supports learning through doing
- The Programme offers challenges
- The Programme offers responsibility and leadership opportunities



These items are identified as leading to the positive development of young people thus reinforcing Scouting Ireland as the leading non-formal educational movement.

3.1.3 Personal Progression

The ability for people to progress through the programme was repeatedly listed as positive. However, it must be noted that this would appear to be in isolation from the Personal Progression Schemes relating more to the ability of a youth member to follow a progressive path through activities, leadership, Special Interest Badges and Adventure Skills. It is clear that the membership view the youth member's progression as a vital component. However, this should not be viewed in-conjunction with the prescribed Personal Progression Schemes nor is it an identification of the scheme as being the most logical avenue for this (this is covered further in challenges).

The membership, have identified the following as positive regarding personal progression:

- Individual personal progression permitted within the programme as a positive
- Specifically tailored journeys for each youth member
- Some feedback saying the personal progression systems are viewed as constructive and supportive

3.1.4 Empowerment

Empowerment is the broad theme given to encompass areas such as the importance people place on youth involvement, youth leadership and a self-driven programme.

The programme is seen to permit:

- The empowerment of youth members through providing opportunities for:
 - Freedom
 - Independence
 - Responsibility
 - Leadership



- The programme is viewed as putting decision making in the young people's hands (thus promoting confidence and leadership)
- Achieving this in the outdoors is a constant theme

3.1.5 Activities

Understandably, activities and their place in what we do was a substantial theme with the membership identifying them as a positive in Scouting. While this does not necessarily have a relationship specifically with programme materials, feedback does discuss the use of Plan Do Review in relation to activities, the use of activities as a learning tool to progress Adventure Skills and Special Interest Badges and as fun.

Interestingly, in the feedback from the Cub Scouts and Beaver Scouts regarding their favourite activities Camping featured top of the list for both, with less adventurous activities further down the ranking. The success of camping in the Beaver Scout section has been concurrent with ONE Programme, with many reporting the attainability of the lower range adventure skills to be assisting this.

3.1.6 Small Groups

Small groups have an almost universal adoption rate across Beaver Scouts, Cub Scouts and Scouts. In Venture Scouts and Rover Scouts some groups state that their low numbers are a barrier to this (i.e sections not achieving critical mass to implement small groups).

It was found that:

- Youth members and Scouters both see them as a constructive
- Assist everyone to be heard, contribute and gain leadership experience
- Challenge youth members to think not just for themselves but as part of a group
- Create an environment where youth members must learn to work as a team



The feeling from the review is that the ‘Patrol System’ or its alternative forms is recognised as a driving force within Scouting across most sections.

3.1.7 Structure

There was substantial feedback that people like the integrated, similar nature of ONE Programme as it applies to the differing sections. This was seen as a positive by most respondents.

The membership valued:

- The link between sections
- That personal growth can be managed across a young person’s scouting journey
- The similarity in structure across sections is viewed as positive
- Shared components such as Adventure Skills

3.1.8 Successes Examples from Results

Table 5: Successes’ Themes with examples of comments that comprise them.

Themes	Examples from Workshop
Adventure Skills	<p>“Clear and common across all sections”</p> <p>“Great for developing skills”</p> <p>“Good structure easy to see what level each Venture is on”</p> <p>“Different elements are great – something for everyone”</p>
Youth Development	<p>“Ability to learn more about their choices and others choices”</p> <p>“Challenging ... All they can achieve!”</p> <p>“Leadership with clear responsibilities”</p> <p>“Learning new skills”</p>
Personal Progression	<p>“Scouts Individual Journey - All different”</p> <p>“set at individual ability by stages”</p> <p>“Encourages and facilitates progression easy to follow”</p>
Empowerment	<p>“Freedom ... Independence....Responsibility for own journey”</p> <p>“Giving leadership and responsibility”</p> <p>“Decision making ...empowers Beavers”</p> <p>“Promotes confidence in youth”</p>



Activities	<p>“Beavers Camping Weekends Away!”</p> <p>“Home out of doors – Beaver prefer the outdoors”</p> <p>“Survival Skills... Camping ... Hiking activities are great”</p> <p>“Annual Camps abroad are fab!”</p> <p>“Activities and events add extra focus ... keeps you active”</p> <p>“Action packed plenty to do”</p>
Small Groups	<p>“Small Team System - Working together with a common goal”</p> <p>“Patrols and PLCs – fun and work well”</p> <p>“Small groups - every voice gets a chance”</p> <p>“Being a Sixer – Leadership opportunity”</p> <p>“Lodges - Small groups move youth away from the 'me' stage”</p>
Structure	<p>“Structure of the ONE Programme”</p> <p>“...clear structure...linked activities and Personal Journey”</p> <p>“Easy to work with and follow”</p> <p>“Section to section link Beavers – Cubs etc. ...”</p> <p>“Simple and clear stages to base activities around that achieve programme goals”</p>



These tools and resources include:

- The books for each section (e.g. The Adventure Quest Book)
- Idea generation tools (e.g. Chadburn)
- Various personal journey tracking aids (e.g. Travel Cards)

Changing the books to a digital version or having them available in app form was frequent feedback. The physical design of the books was a frequent concern (this will be further discussed within the section breakdowns). The content of some of the books was also critiqued as not aiding the delivery of Scouting to youth members.

However, there were some interesting contradictions, where the data stated low opinions of the content of some materials, it was also noted that there was a reasonably high satisfaction score with the very same materials. This could mean that members do not view all tools as fundamental, so while they may critique the content they may not see their poor opinion of the content as a barrier.

3.2.2 Personal Progression Scheme (PPS)

There is wide spread confusion as to how to the Personal Progression Scheme functions across most sections. There is a feeling the systems are:

- Too complex
- Contain too many layers
- Contain too many requirements
- People struggle to ‘pull it all together’

Despite these challenges, the Beaver Scouts, Cub Scouts and Scout sections use the Personal Progression Scheme frequently. However, in Venture Scouts and Rover Scouts, the Personal Progression Scheme has a very low adoption rate.

This finding is interesting in the context of the finding that people see Personal Progression as a strong point of the programme but are generally critical of the Personal Progression Schemes offered within ONE Programme.



3.2.3 Adventure Skills

The negative feedback regarding Adventure Skills is linked to access and criteria rather than the principle of the scheme. If anything, some of this feedback could be considered a result of the strength of the scheme. For example, as some members have reported they like the range of skills widened.

Some of the frequent challenges identified:

- Difficulty in achieving higher levels
- Expense in achieving higher levels
- Access to assessors for higher levels
- Not originally intended for adults to achieve but is now widely worn
- People misunderstand that achieving ALL of these is probably not possible

3.2.4 Complication

The membership has reported that they find the programme is overly complicated. It is reported that the programme is too broad with too many elements to balance.

Members identified challenges surrounding;

- Too many formal supports (tools and resources)
- Unnecessary layers
- Confusion and Complications

Many Scouters and young people find balancing all the various elements into a coherent offering very challenging, such as:

- Personal Progression Scheme
- Adventure Skills
- Special Interest Badges
- Chief Scout Awards

Confusion surrounding how to incorporate SPICES, Special Interest Badges, and Adventure Skills into a Personal Progression System was widely identified.



There appears to be an element of further confusion where some members believe they must be engaging every element in order to be running a correct programme. There is a definite requirement for clarity regarding what a balanced programme looks like.

However, in Venture Scouts and Rover Scouts the complication is as strongly identified. This may be a result of very few sections utilising the resources. These sections focus predominantly on Adventure Skills and the Chief Scout Award schemes while ignoring all other parts.

3.2.5 Paperwork

Members require tracking tools to identify where they or their young people are on their journey or what stage of award they are at. It is reported that there is:

- Too much to track
- No overarching tool
- Nothing to aid the handover of tracking between sections
- Knowing who is working on what week in week out is challenging

Furthermore, it must be noted that self-tracking rather than central tracking is an element of the programme and any move to alter this would require thought. However, the membership is requesting this, thus leading to an opportunity to develop an online tool or app which could encompass the best of both worlds.

3.2.6 Training and Supports

There was substantial feedback from the membership reporting that they do not have sufficient ONE Programme specific training. There is an opportunity for Youth Programme to build better resources and supports in addition, to developing stronger links between the NYPC and Training Team. It was identified by the membership that original transition training was an introduction to the programme rather than training in delivering the programme, with insufficient training given in the delivery of the programme thereafter. It is envisioned that the new training scheme has addressed some of these concerns.



3.2.7 Scouter Attitudes

Unfortunately, there was substantial feedback stating that the attitude of Scouters is a significant issue for many. Difficulties in getting Scouters to change attitudes, specifically, with regard to listening to the young people and upskilling were all identified.

The following points were made regarding attitudes:

- Difficulty in encouraging Scouters to engage with all aspect of the programme
- A lack of understanding, acknowledgement and engagement of the role of the Scouter by Scouters
- Unwillingness to implement and acknowledge youth led programme

It must be noted that for this and similar issues to be tackled it must be done by the association. This is a specific issue for the National Management Committee to address.

3.2.8 SPICES

The membership highlighted a challenge regarding the concept of SPICES. The understanding of the concept is widespread, however, the understanding of how and when to identify them is not. Further, there appears to be a misunderstanding regarding the concept of SPICES with some members regarding it as an element of programme that needs to be planned, run, earned and achieved.

It is reported that:

- the concept of SPICES is difficult to grasp
- the language used regarding SPICES in the books does not appeal to youth members
- Youth members do not engage with the SPICES through the tools of the programme.
- There appears to be a lack of clarity as to the purpose of the concept of SPICES

This appears to be confusion rather than a dislike and as a result should be reasonably easy to rectify and clarify.

3.2.9 Cost

The cost of materials was identified as a significant issue. Feedback was wider than the cost of materials or uniforms. This includes the cost of activities and activities gear. The issue is that the overall cost of being a member of Scouting Ireland is high, and it is identified that programme adds to this.



Items that are specifically mentioned:

- Badges (the number available leads to escalating costs)
- Programme Materials
- Activities

It is acknowledged that, where possible, the aim is to keep costs down. Changes to programme materials need to consider the cost benefit analysis of them as there is significant feedback that for many the burden of cost is great.

3.2.10 Special Interest Badges

The theory of Special Interest Badges is well understood but the application appears to be less understood. Often sections take these on, not as individual personal challenges but, as a whole group exercise. Where this is run as a small group youth led exercise it may not be as much of issue. However, if this is Scouter led, which it often appears to be, this is far from what this scheme was envisioned to be.

It was found that members would like:

- More prescription / direction
- Examples of what a good and a poor Special Interest Badge looks like

There was further feedback requesting a return to a prescriptive 'badge book'. This feedback was not sizeable but did exist.

3.2.11 Too Academic

The membership felt that some of the resources and the materials produced are too academic, specifically with regard to some resources resembling school books, which was perceived as off putting to young people. It was stated that there is too much emphasis on learning objectives making it too 'bookish' and not active enough by taking away from time that could be spent 'doing'.



3.2.12 Challenges Examples from Results

Themes	Examples from workshop
Tools & Resources	<p>“Beaver Book formatting ... make a poster instead for walls per lodge ”</p> <p>“Really confusing for kids and adults”</p> <p>“Lack of programme Resources”</p> <p>“Resources – Rover handbooks are out of date”</p> <p>“Scout Book - get rid of it replace with Scouting Trail”</p> <p>“Venture Book is not interesting, not used, lacks clarity”</p> <p>Books - “ too big and bulky” ... “Smaller would be better”</p>
Personal Progression Scheme	<p>“Group journey is easier so it is not really a personal journey”</p> <p>“too many requirements to get badges”</p> <p>“Not used in Rover Scout Section” “No knowledge of it”</p> <p>“Rover PPS - very high level expecting the fruits of previous sections”</p> <p>“Crean Awards - not current like rest of programme”</p> <p>“Suas & Trasna very badly explained in book”</p> <p>“never heard of Suas & Trasna until yesterday”</p>
Adventure Skills	<p>“Stages 1 & 2 inaccessible for Beavers as written”</p> <p>“too many ticks to achieve before receiving skill level badge”</p> <p>“Highest Levels are too difficult”</p> <p>“Higher skills very costly to achieve - stopping achieving full potential”</p> <p>“need to be aligned with boating awards”</p> <p>“ there should be more types of adventure skills”</p>
Complicated	<p>“Materials - too many resources - unnecessary”</p> <p>“A lot for the Beavers to remember - Simplify”</p> <p>“ It’s hard to figure out where to start ... overly detailed”</p> <p>“Symbolic Framework too many layers Lodges/Tribes/Bree/Conn/Ruarc etc.”</p> <p>“To broad - Badges, SIB, CSA, Adv Skills, PPS ...”</p> <p>“Balancing all aspects very difficult”</p> <p>“Complicated needs to be simplified ... hard to understand ”</p>
Scouters	<p>“ ... not all people have the skills to be scouting ”</p> <p>“Scouters attitude to youth and lack of knowledge”</p> <p>“Find it very hard to get all scouters to engage with aspects of programme”</p> <p>“Scouters attitude ... wanting to use old programme ”</p> <p>“Leaders wanting to earn badges”</p> <p>“Scouters - not asking scouts opinions”</p> <p>“Lack of understanding of role of scouter”</p>



SPICES	<p>"Lost on leaders / Beavers 'not adults/child friendly' both struggle for various reasons"</p> <p>" need to change the language ... not age-appropriate "</p> <p>"Cubs not interested in knowing about them"</p> <p>" don't need to be reviewing them ... need to focus on what works/doesn't"</p> <p>"Hard to integrate into the programme"</p> <p>"Difficult to get Ventures to progress as individual though SPICES"</p>
Cost	<p>"Books , Beads, Badges, Maps equals expensive"</p> <p>"Beaver Bags have no value for money"</p> <p>"Badges are very expensive"</p> <p>"Cost of uniforms"</p> <p>"Very expensive"</p> <p>"Cost of the Bead Box"</p>
Special Interest Badges	<p>"Hard to tailor to each child"</p> <p>"not enough guidelines"</p> <p>"need more prescription and examples of how to do them"</p> <p>"Good but more structure within each section. What works as a Cub SIB doesn't work for Scouts. Scouts get frustrated because they don't know what is expected. More defined structure."</p>
Paperwork	<p>"Lack of Admin materials"</p> <p>"Tracking / Record System not sufficient"</p> <p>"PPS leads to too much administration and tracking ... it's very difficult"</p> <p>"PPS replace with log book to track progress"</p> <p>"Scouters don't have time to manage all the administration"</p>
Chief Scout Award	<p>"Intercultural part too difficult to meet"</p> <p>"CSA awarded before Crean Awards"</p> <p>"Rovers not doing it - is it too challenging? Or international trip too much"</p> <p>"Not enough CSA mentors"</p> <p>"registering for Gaisce before CSA means cannot do CSA"</p>
Too Academic	<p>"Learning lessons / Learning Objectives makes it feel like school"</p> <p>"Book gives negative association with school"</p> <p>"It feels like school sometimes "</p> <p>"Lost none formal aspect of scouting"</p> <p>" it is too academic"</p>
Training & Supports	<p>"Adult training – needs to be specific to section"</p> <p>"Left hanging due to no supports in games, activities, upskilling"</p> <p>"Lack of Scouter Training"</p> <p>"Scouters not informed well enough on programme for badges"</p> <p>"Unaware of what the ONE Programme is about"</p>



3.3 Beavers Scouts

It was found that the fundamentals of the Scout Method are broadly present across this section nationally. It is clear from the results that some of the materials are not being utilised as envisaged.

Positive findings came from the Beaver Scout questionnaire where outdoor activities like Camping and Camp Fires ranked highest amongst their chosen activities.

Any changes made should be aimed toward streamlining, assisting clarity to permit assisting Beaver Scouters to deliver programme. Beaver Scouters speak highly of Adventure Skills, Special Interest Badges, The Chief Scout Award, the Personal Progression Scheme and Log Chews. They would like review or improve the memory bag (the physical design not the concept), the map (a printable version should be considered) and would like the characters names in the book to aligned with the letters of the SPICES so as to permit ease of understanding, as they are in the Cub section material.

Table 6: Summary Stage 1 Beaver Scout Questionnaire Results

Beaver Scout Elements	Frequency of Use	Satisfaction Rate
Book	Never	17%
	Almost never	24%
	Once or twice per year	16%
	Every few months	20%
	Monthly	15%
	Weekly or more	7%
Map	Never	43%
	Almost never	22%
	Once or twice per year	11%
	Every few months	17%
	Monthly	7%
	Weekly or More	1%
Memory Bag	Never	56%
	Almost never	21%
	Once or twice per year	12%
	Every few months	5%
	Monthly	3%
	Weekly or more	2%



Personal Progression Scheme	Never	22%	Completely Satisfied	9%
	Almost Never	13%	Very Satisfied	25%
	Once or Twice Per Year	36%	Somewhat Satisfied	44%
	Every Few Months	17%	Somewhat dissatisfied	14%
	Monthly	5%	Very dissatisfied	6%
	Weekly or more	7%	Completely Dissatisfied	3%
Scout Group – Lodges (Presence)	No	0.0%		
	Yes	92.6%		
	Sometimes	7.4%		
	Don't Know	0.0%		
Chief Scout Award	Yes	55%	Completely Satisfied	17%
	No	45%	Very Satisfied	40%
			Somewhat Satisfied	32%
			Somewhat dissatisfied	8%
			Very dissatisfied	2%
			Completely Dissatisfied	1%
Adventure Skills	Never	3%	Strongly agree	52%
	Almost never	4%	Agree	42%
	Once or twice per year	5%	Neither agree nor disagree	6%
	Every few months	28%	Disagree	0%
	Monthly	38%	Strongly disagree	0%
	Weekly or more	22%		
Special Interest Badges	Never	15%	Completely Satisfied	14%
	Almost never	12%	Very Satisfied	36%
	Once or twice per year	24%	Somewhat Satisfied	39%
	Every few months	33%	Somewhat dissatisfied	9%
	Monthly	9%	Very dissatisfied	1%
	Weekly or more	7%	Completely Dissatisfied	1%
Concept of SPICES Review/Discuss	Never	10%	Completely Satisfied	8%
	Almost never	11%	Very Satisfied	25%
	Once or twice per year	20%	Somewhat Satisfied	42%
	Every few months	21%	Somewhat dissatisfied	14%
	Monthly	24%	Very dissatisfied	5%
	Weekly or more	15%	Completely Dissatisfied	7%
Nautical Badges	Never	75%	Completely Satisfied	5%
	Almost Never	11%	Very Satisfied	24%
	Once or Twice Per Year	11%	Somewhat Satisfied	55%
	Every Few Months	1%	Somewhat dissatisfied	10%
	Monthly	1%	Very dissatisfied	0%
	Weekly or more	0%	Completely Dissatisfied	6%
Scouters Manual	Never	8%	Completely Satisfied	8%
	Almost never	8%	Very Satisfied	41%
	Once or twice per year	11%	Somewhat Satisfied	39%
	Every few months	29%	Somewhat dissatisfied	8%
	Monthly	29%	Very dissatisfied	3%
	Weekly or more	14%	Completely Dissatisfied	1%
	Other (please specify)	2%		



3.4 Cub Scouts

The Special Interest Badges, Adventure Skills and Chief Scout Award are programme elements which are viewed as positive and used regularly.

The Adventure Quest book requires a revision when the opportunity rises. Although it has a low satisfaction rate it has not been identified as a barrier to delivery of the programme.

The Cub Scout section identified one of the largest anomalies of the process. Respondents are divided on Travel Cards and SPICE beads. The feedback was either complete love of these components or a complete dislike. This clearly demonstrates confusion and perhaps indicates an education gap in addition to a dislike of the resources.

Feedback from the Cub Scouts points to a strong preference for outdoor activities, such as camping and hikes, rather than parades and meetings.

Table 7: Summary Stage 1 Cub Scouts Questionnaire Results

Cub Scout Elements	Frequency of Use	Satisfaction Rate
Book	Never	16%
	Almost never	17%
	Once or twice per year	14%
	Every few months	25%
	Monthly	17%
	Weekly or more	12%
Lands of Adventure	Never	39%
	Almost never	17%
	Once or twice per year	12%
	Every few months	21%
	Monthly	10%
	Weekly or more	2%
Travel Cards & SPICES Beads	Never	37%
	Almost never	15%
	Once or twice per year	9%
	Every few months	19%
	Monthly	16%
	Weekly or more	5%



Personal Progression Scheme	Never	26%	Completely Satisfied	10%
	Almost Never	13%	Very Satisfied	20%
	Once or Twice Per Year	33%	Somewhat Satisfied	39%
	Every Few Months	18%	Somewhat dissatisfied	20%
	Monthly	6%	Very dissatisfied	5%
	Weekly or more	4%		
Small Groups – Sixes (Present)	No	2%		
	Yes	96%		
	Sometimes	3%		
	Don't Know	0%		
Chief Scout Award	Never	25%	Completely Satisfied	14%
	Almost never	11%	Very Satisfied	42%
	Once or twice per year	19%	Somewhat Satisfied	36%
	Every few months	17%	Somewhat dissatisfied	7%
	Monthly	19%	Very dissatisfied	2%
	Weekly or more	9%	Completely Dissatisfied	0%
Adventure Skills	Never	0%	Completely Satisfied	38%
	Almost never	3%	Very Satisfied	47%
	Once or twice per year	3%	Somewhat Satisfied	13%
	Every few months	22%	Somewhat dissatisfied	1%
	Monthly	29%	Very dissatisfied	0%
	Weekly or more	42%	Completely Dissatisfied	0%
Special Interest Badges	Never	7.0%	Completely Satisfied	22%
	Almost never	7.0%	Very Satisfied	32%
	Once or twice per year	30.3%	Somewhat Satisfied	34%
	Every few months	30.3%	Somewhat dissatisfied	10%
	Monthly	18.3%	Very dissatisfied	0%
	Weekly or more	7.0%	Completely Dissatisfied	1%
Concept of SPICES	Never	17%	Completely Satisfied	9%
	Almost never	10%	Very Satisfied	26%
	Once or twice per year	11%	Somewhat Satisfied	29%
	Every few months	31%	Somewhat dissatisfied	20%
	Monthly	23%	Very dissatisfied	8%
	Weekly or more	8%	Completely Dissatisfied	9%
Nautical Badges	Never	65%	Completely Satisfied	16%
	Almost Never	14%	Very Satisfied	30%
	Once or Twice Per Year	16%	Somewhat Satisfied	33%
	Every Few Months	3%	Somewhat dissatisfied	17%
	Monthly	2%	Very dissatisfied	3%
	Weekly or more	0%	Completely Dissatisfied	1%
Scouters Manual	Never	9%	Completely Satisfied	10%
	Almost never	13%	Very Satisfied	37%
	Once or twice per year	16%	Somewhat Satisfied	41%
	Every few months	22%	Somewhat dissatisfied	9%
	Monthly	22%	Very dissatisfied	1%
	Weekly or more	15%	Completely Dissatisfied	3%
	Other (please specify)	4%		



3.5 Scouts

The Scout Section is very positive on Adventure Skills and the Patrol System. Interestingly, other resources such as the Scouting Trail and other various online resources, for example, those produced by the Scout Team, are popular in the Scout Section.

The Spirit of Adventure book, Food Dump and Map, and the Chadburn all received unfavourable feedback. However, through discussions, it would appear that removing of these elements would not necessarily improve or dis-improve the delivery of the programme. Similar to other sections, there is the need for clarity regarding the application of the programme. However, feedback demonstrates that the majority of Scout Sections heavily rely on the Adventure Skills to deliver Scouting.

Additional feedback states that the physical makeup of the book is too school book like and bulky preventing Scouts bringing it on activities. It was reported that the narrative of Tom Crean does not appeal to the age demographic as it appears too historic and academic as opposed to adventurous.

Table 8: Summary Stage 1 Scouts Questionnaire Results

Scout Elements	Frequency of Use	Satisfaction Rate
Book	Never	15%
	Almost never	22%
	Once or twice per year	14%
	Every few months	21%
	Monthly	22%
	Weekly or more	7%
	Completely Satisfied	2%
Food Dump & Map	Never	63%
	Almost never	22%
	Once or twice per year	4%
	Every few months	6%
	Monthly	5%
	Weekly or more	0%
	Very Satisfied	10%
Concept of SPICES	Never	7%
	Almost never	22%
	Once or twice per year	18%
	Every few months	32%
	Monthly	17%
	Weekly or more	5%
	Somewhat Satisfied	42%



Personal Progression Scheme	Never	16%	Completely Satisfied	7%
	Almost Never	12%	Very Satisfied	30%
	Once or Twice Per Year	20%	Somewhat Satisfied	41%
	Every Few Months	24%	Somewhat dissatisfied	12%
	Monthly	18%	Very dissatisfied	4%
	Weekly or more	10%	Completely Dissatisfied	5%
Small Groups – Patrols (Present)	No	1.6%	Strongly Agree	71%
	Yes	92.2%	Agree	25%
	Sometimes	6.2%	Neither Agree nor Disagree	3%
	Don't Know	0.0%	Disagree	1%
			Strongly Disagree	0%
Chief Scout Award	Never	27%	Completely Satisfied	13%
	Almost never	21%	Very Satisfied	31%
	Once or twice per year	29%	Somewhat Satisfied	40%
	Every few months	13%	Somewhat dissatisfied	9%
	Monthly	7%	Very dissatisfied	4%
	Weekly or more	3%	Completely Dissatisfied	3%
Adventure Skills	Never	2%	Completely Satisfied	20%
	Almost never	5%	Very Satisfied	45%
	Once or twice per year	3%	Somewhat Satisfied	26%
	Every few months	20%	Somewhat dissatisfied	4%
	Monthly	33%	Very dissatisfied	3%
	Weekly or more	37%	Completely Dissatisfied	2%
Special Interest Badges	Never	14%	Completely Satisfied	6%
	Almost never	20%	Very Satisfied	19%
	Once or twice per year	29%	Somewhat Satisfied	52%
	Every few months	27%	Somewhat dissatisfied	14%
	Monthly	8%	Very dissatisfied	5%
	Weekly or more	2%	Completely Dissatisfied	5%
Nautical Badges	Never	74%	Completely Satisfied	8%
	Almost Never	13%	Very Satisfied	17%
	Once or Twice Per Year	8%	Somewhat Satisfied	41%
	Every Few Months	3%	Somewhat dissatisfied	18%
	Monthly	2%	Very dissatisfied	7%
	Weekly or more	1%	Completely Dissatisfied	9%
Scouters Manual	Never	20%	Completely Satisfied	2%
	Almost never	16%	Very Satisfied	20%
	Once or twice per year	15%	Somewhat Satisfied	55%
	Every few months	19%	Somewhat dissatisfied	14%
	Monthly	16%	Very dissatisfied	4%
	Weekly or more	9%	Completely Dissatisfied	6%
	Other (please specify)	5%		



3.6 Venture Scouts

The Adventure Skills and Chief Scout Award are found to be the dominant programme components in this section. The Personal Progression Scheme and Symbolic framework are not widely used. Respondents and participants requested more prescription in all elements as there is confusion as to how the programme should operate.

It could be assumed that the low adoption rate of programme materials in this section highlights a wider problem that needs addressing earlier than other issues in other sections.

There are two interesting findings regarding this section. It is found that the average length of service of a Venture Scouter is considerably longer than other Sections. In addition, there was significant interest in the Nautical Framework, more than any other section; this interest may be a result of the lack of uptake in other areas of the programme such as Personal Progression Scheme.

Table 9: Summary Stage 1 Venture Scouts Questionnaire Results

Venture Scout Elements	Frequency of Use		Satisfaction Rate	
Book	Never	30%	Completely Satisfied	3%
	Almost never	30%	Very Satisfied	8%
	Once or twice per year	15%	Somewhat Satisfied	44%
	Every few months	18%	Somewhat dissatisfied	20%
	Monthly	6%	Very dissatisfied	14%
	Weekly or more	2%	Completely Dissatisfied	11%
SPICES Wheel	Never	48%	Completely satisfied	5%
	Almost never	18%	Very satisfied	10%
	Once or twice per year	23%	Somewhat satisfied	43%
	Every few months	8%	Somewhat dissatisfied	15%
	Monthly	2%	Very dissatisfied	17%
	Weekly or more	1%	Completely dissatisfied	11%
Concept of SPICES	Never	35%	Completely Satisfied	3%
	Almost never	26%	Very Satisfied	17%
	Once or twice per year	11%	Somewhat Satisfied	45%
	Every few months	20%	Somewhat dissatisfied	18%
	Monthly	7%	Very dissatisfied	5%
	Weekly or more	1%	Completely Dissatisfied	11%



Personal Progression Scheme	Never	47%	Completely Satisfied	5%
	Almost Never	22%	Very Satisfied	15%
	Once or Twice Per Year	11%	Somewhat Satisfied	43%
	Every Few Months	9%	Somewhat dissatisfied	20%
	Monthly	9%	Very dissatisfied	7%
	Weekly or more	2%	Completely Dissatisfied	9%
	Small Groups - Crew & Executives (Present)	No	35%	Strongly agree
	Yes	33%	Agree	32%
	Sometimes	26%	Neither agree nor disagree	41%
	Don't Know	6%	Disagree	3%
			Strongly disagree	1%
Chief Scout Award	Never	32%	Completely Satisfied	14%
	Almost never	30%	Very Satisfied	33%
	Once or twice per year	20%	Somewhat Satisfied	31%
	Every few months	9%	Somewhat dissatisfied	10%
	Monthly	6%	Very dissatisfied	5%
	Weekly or more	3%	Completely Dissatisfied	6%
	Adventure Skills	Never	11%	Completely Satisfied
Almost never		11%	Very Satisfied	37%
Once or twice per year		15%	Somewhat Satisfied	35%
Every few months		33%	Somewhat dissatisfied	5%
Monthly		20%	Very dissatisfied	1%
Weekly or more		11%	Completely Dissatisfied	0%
Special Interest Badges		Never	34%	Completely Satisfied
	Almost never	30%	Very Satisfied	25%
	Once or twice per year	17%	Somewhat Satisfied	45%
	Every few months	13%	Somewhat dissatisfied	13%
	Monthly	2%	Very dissatisfied	4%
	Weekly or more	3%	Completely Dissatisfied	5%
	Nautical Badges	Never	83%	Completely Satisfied
Almost Never		6%	Very Satisfied	6%
Once or Twice Per Year		8%	Somewhat Satisfied	54%
Every Few Months		1%	Somewhat dissatisfied	28%
Monthly		3%	Very dissatisfied	2%
Weekly or more		1%	Completely Dissatisfied	8%
Scouters Manual		Never	33%	Completely Satisfied
	Almost never	18%	Very Satisfied	16%
	Once or twice per year	15%	Somewhat Satisfied	54%
	Every few months	18%	Somewhat dissatisfied	16%
	Monthly	7%	Very dissatisfied	6%
	Weekly or more	7%	Completely Dissatisfied	1%
	Other (please specify)	3%		



3.7 Rover Scouts

The Chief Scout Award, achieving upper levels of Adventure Skills and the Explorer Belt and other national activities make up the bulk of the formal programme engaged by Rover Scouts. Adherence to a symbolic framework or Personal Progression Scheme appears to be close to zero. The Rover handbook and Personal Progression Scheme have a very low adoption rate.

Despite having feedback from a significant percentage of Rover Scouts the review ran into difficulty in engaging Rover Scouts who were using the programme. This has limited the constructive feedback on ONE Programme material and resources.

Rovers Scouts is currently a programme section, however, Scouting Irelands youth programme is not providing suitable supports for them. This may be as a result of a number of issues. One of them may be that the initial programme was designed to meet a three year age range section and not the current 18-26 years age range.

Table 10: Summary Stage 1 Rover Scouts Questionnaire Results

Rover Scout Elements	Frequency of Use		Satisfaction Rate	
Book	Never	39%	Completely Satisfied	2%
	Almost never	34%	Very Satisfied	5%
	Once or twice per year	16%	Somewhat Satisfied	35%
	Every few months	8%	Somewhat dissatisfied	29%
	Monthly	2%	Very dissatisfied	17%
	Weekly or more	0%	Completely Dissatisfied	12%
SPICES Wheel	Never	35%	Completely Satisfied	2%
	Almost never	26%	Very Satisfied	11%
	Once or twice per year	17%	Somewhat Satisfied	45%
	Every few months	11%	Somewhat dissatisfied	28%
	Monthly	11%	Very dissatisfied	13%
	Weekly or more	0%	Completely Dissatisfied	0%
Personal Progression Scheme	Never	60%	Completely Satisfied	2%
	Almost Never	23%	Very Satisfied	12%
	Once or Twice Per Year	8%	Somewhat Satisfied	36%
	Every Few Months	6%	Somewhat dissatisfied	31%
	Monthly	0%	Very dissatisfied	17%



	Weekly or more	2%	Completely dissatisfied	2%
Small Groups - Project Teams (Present)	No	50%	Strongly Agree	26%
	Yes	20%	Agree	42%
	Sometimes	26%	Neither Agree nor Disagree	23%
	Don't Know	4%	Disagree	2%
			Strongly Disagree	2%
			Other (please specify)	5%
Chief Scout Award	Never	43%	Completely Satisfied	8%
	Almost never	35%	Very Satisfied	18%
	Once or twice per year	5%	Somewhat Satisfied	51%
	Every few months	13%	Somewhat dissatisfied	18%
	Monthly	3%	Very dissatisfied	3%
	Weekly or more	3%	Completely Dissatisfied	3%
Adventure Skills	Never	18%	Completely Satisfied	17%
	Almost never	14%	Very Satisfied	42%
	Once or twice per year	23%	Somewhat Satisfied	32%
	Every few months	18%	Somewhat dissatisfied	2%
	Monthly	23%	Very dissatisfied	5%
	Weekly or more	5%	Completely Dissatisfied	2%
Special Interest Badges	Never	41%	Completely Satisfied	3%
	Almost never	26%	Very Satisfied	24%
	Once or twice per year	18%	Somewhat Satisfied	50%
	Every few months	8%	Somewhat dissatisfied	18%
	Monthly	3%	Very dissatisfied	0%
	Weekly or more	5%	Completely Dissatisfied	6%
Nautical Badges	Never	95%	Completely Satisfied	0%
	Almost Never	5%	Very Satisfied	5%
	Once or Twice Per Year	0%	Somewhat Satisfied	48%
	Every Few Months	0%	Somewhat dissatisfied	33%
	Monthly	0%	Very dissatisfied	0%
	Weekly or more	0%	Completely Dissatisfied	14%
Scouters Manual	Never	33%	Completely Satisfied	3%
	Almost never	14%	Very Satisfied	17%
	Once or twice per year	31%	Somewhat Satisfied	52%
	Every few months	8%	Somewhat dissatisfied	21%
	Monthly	8%	Very dissatisfied	7%
	Weekly or more	6%	Completely Dissatisfied	0%



3.8 Chief Scout Award

The Chief Scout Award is specifically referenced in this report as a standalone item as a result of a motion passed at National Council 2016. As this award operates across all five programme sections there are differing criteria per section as such this feedback is section specific. It should be noted that the award is very popular.

The **Beaver Scout** section has a high adoption rate. 55% of Colonies have Beaver Scouts who have attempted or achieved the Chief Scout Award. 66% strongly agree that it is a positive tool to deliver Scouting. However, there are challenges as it appears that some colonies are approaching the award in a collective manner. This is not how the award was designed to operate.

Like Beaver Scouts the **Cub Scout** Section has a high adoption rate of the Chief Scout. 79% of Cub Scout Packs have Cub Scouts who have attempted or achieved the Chief Scout Award, of which 76% agree that it is a useful tool to deliver Scouting. However, again, there is strong evidence of it being run in a pack wide or group method approach. This is a behaviour which is contrary to how the award was designed and unfortunately there is evidence of this being widespread.

Troublingly, there is evidence that demonstrates the Personal Progression Scheme is being neglected in favour of engaging in the Chief Scout Award. It may be an option to explore developing a stronger tie between the awards, with the final step in the Personal Progression Scheme acting as an entry point to the Beaver Scout and Cub Scout Chief Scout Award.

Regarding the above points, it is important to note that these challenges may also be viewed as a symptom of the success of the Chief Scout award as opposed to failures of the process. It is a highly popular component in the Beaver Scout and Cub Scout sections.

The challenges identified with the Chief Scout Award for the Scout, Venture and Rover Scout Section are very similar. In the **Scout Section**, the Chief Scout Award is less popular than in the younger



sections; this may be as a result of the award being less group lead. Perhaps as more Beaver Scouts and Cub Scouts achieve the Chief Scout Award and progress to Scouts these numbers may increase.

Issues such as state exam clashes, the labour intensive nature of the award and the fact that Gaisce/DOE is often done in school may limit the up take. Comments such as the “... *Gaisce award is easier to achieve and is understood nationally. Very challenging requiring big leader and parent support*” were recorded.

The areas identified for review within the Chief Scout Award are, but not limited to, the role of the mentor, the link between the Crean Awards, the Intercultural aspect of the award and the promotion of the award nationally.

The issues for **Venture** and **Rover Scouts** are the very similar to the Scout section. One of the biggest obstacles identified was the requirement to register via Scouting for the Gaisce / DOE and the fact that people are engaging in this journey via alternative routes. Feedback states, “*Scouting Ireland needs to promote it more, champion it more as there is massive effort involved, the difficulty level at a time in life when exams are important is listed, a lack of information, a difficulty with access to mentors and a difficulty of access to higher level adventure skills mentors to achieve criteria.*”

Overall, there is a large cluster of feedback suggesting that the intercultural element of the award is problematic, reporting that it is difficult to organise and could do with some element of review.



3.9 Large Scale Considerations

During the process a number of issues that did not fit within the practice of ONE Programme neither were they sections specific were acknowledged. These are as follows:

3.9.1 Scouters Manual

The Scouters Manual is reported as being used, specifically by the younger sections Scouters. It is recognised as an aid to deliver scouting but it is identified as needing some up-dating and revising. Rewriting the Scouter Manual would seem to be a relatively easy starting point in order to address some of the challenges around understanding programme. It is recommended that the Scouters Manual is reviewed and publish once completed. However, it is recommended that as each component (i.e. chapters/sections) is ready it be released.

3.9.2 Senior Sections

The challenges facing the senior sections (Ventures and Rovers) appear to be greater than ONE Programme. This review would point to fundamental struggles with the Scout Method in these age ranges. It is apparent that a larger examination of these sections is required, specifically regarding the application of the Scout Method, with the aim to produce a programme for the sections

3.9.3 Resources

As a long term goal, there should be an examination of the multiple resources in each section with the aim to streamline. Currently, each section has section specific resources with approximately 10 elements per section. This should be approached as and when stock levels are low so as to align with reordering.

3.9.4 ONE Programme Brand

It is suggested that the ONE Programme brand be retired. ONE Programme is the programme of Scouting Ireland. Frequently there is feedback such as *“we do programme just not the ONE Programme”* or *“we are 50% ONE Programme”*. There needs to be a shift away from this disconnect toward the recognition that scouting is programme and that there are not different types or brands.



3.9.5 Programme Responsibility

Each member of Scouting Ireland owns their own programme. This is a core building block of ONE Programme fundamentals where personal progression and youth involvement are listed in planning as central pillars. However, the National Youth Programme Committee (NYPC) under the leadership of the Chief Commissioner for Youth Programme has responsibility for developing and maintaining programme supports, programme materials, competency levels and supporting the programme structures. During ONE Programme roll-out period there was a moratorium on making changes to materials. This period has now expired and the NYPC should endeavour to foster a permanent revolution where the programme supports are adapted to meet the changing needs of the association over time. The NYPC and CCYP should take responsibility for the ongoing maintenance of programme effectiveness and materials to ensure that they remain relevant and fresh. Hopefully, this would limit the need for such an extensive refresh in the future.

3.9.6 Points to Note

In addressing issues identified within this review it is important to be wary of 'low hanging fruit'. Not all of the issues members report to disliking or find challenging can be changed. In particular, regarding some of them, changing may make no difference to the delivery of programme on the ground. If positive change is the desired outcome changes must be approached in a co-ordinated way. To this end, the data collected from the review can be used to dig deeper to inform changes.

Regarding changes to the programme the issue of complication and confusion needs to be considered in the design of any changes. Given that confusion ranks as a top issue there should be concern regarding trying to solve problems with further materials. During analysis it was identified that streamlining was called for more often than additional explanatory resources were.



4 Barriers to Youth Programme

During our analysis we approached the issues of delivering programme in differing ways. We looked at the programme via multiple lenses, for example section by section, day to day running of the programme and a helicopter view. The barriers to youth programme are examined from this helicopter view.

Interestingly, the materials and resources while ranking as an issue are not the top issue. When exploring some of the issues it is identified that they are minor but are reoccurring across various strata of our association. Many of the issues identified are outside the control of the programme. The fact that very few of these directly relate to the Scout Method should be seen as largely positive.

Below is a table ranking the themes identified, based on the number of observations reported. This table also designates if the issue is a direct Youth Programme issue or not:

Table 11: Overarching Barriers to youth programme

Barriers Overarching Themes	Rank	Within/Outside
Training	1	Scouting Ireland and YP
Cost	2	Scouting Ireland
Adventure Skills	3	Youth Programme
Attitude	4	Scouting Ireland
Commitment	5	Scouting Ireland
Complication	6	Youth Programme
Resources	7	Youth Programme
Age-appropriateness	8	Youth Programme
Scouter Numbers	9	Scouting Ireland
Administration	10	Scouting Ireland and YP
Too Academic	11	Youth Programme



Some of the issues listed here, such as Adventure Skills, were actually cost, access and skills related when examined rather than the structure, concept or application of the element. It is important to note, that the review did not have the capacity to assess the difference in opinions between scouts who took part in the new Woodbadge training scheme and those who have engaged in the new training scheme launched 2016. However, during the process the Programme Review Team did consult with the Training Review Team and it is envisioned that the new training scheme may bridge the identified gaps in the previous Woodbadge scheme.

The table below lists the items which are not directly under the direction of Youth Programme but which the membership reported as a barrier to the delivery of programme. These barriers have been highlighted in this way with the expectation that the NMC would direct other teams within the association to assist with the recommendations.

Table 12: Barriers to Programme External to Youth Programme

Barriers to Programme external to YP	Rank
Training	1
Cost	2
Attitude	4
Commitment	5
Scouter Numbers	9

In this context the barriers are as follows:

Training - Feedback related to the standardised Scouting Ireland training, specifically programme training and skills training with small but significant feedback regarding the transition training for ONE Programme.



Cost – This issue is in regard to the overall cost of membership including subs, activities, uniform, badges and materials, kit and premises upkeep. There is a cost to what we do but this review has signaled that the membership see finance as a barrier to progress.

Attitude –Unfortunately, attitude was significantly frequent theme. This feedback came from both Scouters and young people regarding other Scouters. Predominantly, this was concerning Scouters being unwilling to try new things, attend training, engage in youth led programme, change attitudes or work in specific way. Often, this related to youth empowerment or the handing over control to newer/younger Scouters.

Commitment – The time commitment required to be involved in Scouting was identified as a barrier to ONE Programme. This is identified as a serious barrier to implementation and progress. Often the comments listed aspiration to increase the number of activities and expand the range of challenges presented to young people; however, the realities of life were reported as preventing this from developing.

Numbers – The difficulty in recruiting and retaining Scouters is a concern to members. This is identified as limiting the potential challenges and activities presented to young people from activities to elements of ONE Programme. In the Venture Scout section it was highlighted that the number within a section limits the ability of the section to function as they are not achieving critical mass, leading to difficulties in the application of the Scout Method.



5 Outside the Scope

Some feedback attained during the review process fell outside of the remit of the scope of the programme review. However, given that this feedback was collected it is listed here without bias or analysis. Below are some points regarding ONE Programme development phase which may be useful for large scale projects the association embarks on in the future.

- The amount of work expected from volunteers during the design and roll out was excessive.
- The amount of work expected of Staff was at times over and above what could be reasonably expected from an employee.
- The lines between volunteers and Staff were often confused due to misalignment. This led to needlessly lost hours.
- The National Management Committee should have been more actively engaged from the beginning of the process.
- The politics around the process spiralled out of control; this should have been anticipated and better managed.
- The timelines in place were unrealistic
- Some decisions, like withholding books until training was completed caused irritation and lead to disengagement by some volunteers on the ground.
- There was a lack of co-ordination across the wider association. The Youth Programme teams focused on design. However, other teams were not planning for the roll-out and follow-up support.
- The communication surrounding the project should have been better planned with greater continual engagement as to what was happening.
- The pilot groups felt marginalised, which given the large service they provided was an unfortunate outcome.



6 Conclusion

In presenting this report to Scouting Ireland it is our hope that the membership “find themselves” within its pages. The goal of the review was to listen, capture and deliver an unbiased report. The depth of the programme is echoed in the sheer size of this document and the forthcoming full findings report. It is noteworthy that the programme has a vast array of tools and materials.

I would like to offer my sincere thanks to everybody who helped along the way. No project like this happens without the support and assistance of many people. It is important to note that any review of this nature can only occur on account of the work of those who have travelled this road before. The sheer depth of Programme actions and resources to review is an impressive testament to Scouting Irelands programme planners, implementers and consumers.

This review was initiated and conducted with nothing but the utmost respect for everybody who dons a neckerchief and tries to deliver programme. It always aimed to try and bolster our Youth Programme and hopefully to feed into a greater cycle of Plan Do Review for all of us across Scouting Ireland.

While lists are impersonal there are people who gave up evenings, mornings and weekends to this project so I really want to make note of who they are for a simple thanks. So in no particular order I'd like to thank:

Louis Mullee, Brendan Lynch, Ian Davy, Dave Shalloo, Karol Quinn, Collie Kavanagh, Peter Sheehan, Mark Hollman, Patsy Kelly, Stephen Synnott, Steven Cull, Troels Frockhammer, James 'the superior' Carroll, Richard Scriven, Noel Leahy, Tom Clarke, Gary Oxberry, Sinclair Trotter, Pauline Lucas, Conor O'Shea, All the Provincial Youth Programme Reps (Dillon, Cathereen, Michelle, Steve, Séan, Stephen), the section specific Programme Commissioners (Ian, Rory, Una, Glen, Ruairí) and national team members who helped out.

Outside the list I want to draw attention to the phenomenal work of Dubheasa Kelly. In the clearest possible terms this project owes a substantial debt to her professionalism, dedication and ability.

Finally to every Scouter and Youth Member, who took the time to fill in a survey, to come to a workshop or who has engaged in the process - I thank you. Programme is what we do and we do it really well. However, let us never lose sight that personal progression should not stop when we leave the ranks of the youth sections. Together let us all try and make Scouting Irelands Programme the best it possibly can be.

Yours in Scouting,

James Carroll.
Programme Review - Team Lead